	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	IMPROVEMENT ACTION PLAN	DECISIONS OF MEMBER WORKING GROUP	PROGRESS
I	Scrutiny in a Hung Authority			
	A further review be undertaken of the Cabinet Member system to assess whether this is providing sufficient cross party and non-executive challenge. NB. If it is considered that this is a robust and effective process then:-	A Further review to be undertaken in consultation with Cabinet Members and Spokespersons to identify whether the Cabinet Member system is an effective forum for pre-Scrutiny of Executive decisions.	The Working Group considered the proposals and recommended that it was essential that the role of Scrutiny/Pre-Scrutiny remains with the Scrutiny and Review Committee's. (Agreed by Member Working Group 24.10.07). The Member Working Group 05.12.07 agreed to strengthen the communication between Cabinet Spokespersons and S&R	The Scrutiny Team has begun a review of the S&R handbook that will include this protocol. This will be ready for January 2008.
	Cabinet Member spokespersons to be		Committees and that a further report be brought back for further discussion. Not agreed – see above.	
	viewed as part of the scrutiny system. Scrutiny protocols handbook and constitution to be amended accordingly.	 Scrutiny Protocols and the Council's Constitution, etc to be amended to reflect that spokespersons are part of the Scrutiny Function. 		
	 The role of Scrutiny & Review be adjusted to focus on in-depth policy development and review investigations. 	Scrutiny Review Committees to focus on policy development and task and finish reviews. Pre Scrutiny no longer to be within the remit of S & R Committees	Not agreed – see above. The Working Group also agreed that a	
	 Systems to be developed to ensure effective communication between the Scrutiny Chairs and Cabinet Spokespersons (eg. regular meetings, standing agenda item for Cabinet Spokespersons reports etc). 	 Consideration of mechanisms to ensure appropriate two- way communication between the Scrutiny Chairs and Cabinet Spokespersons so that Executive Members are held properly to account. 	protocol should be developed to strengthen the communications between Cabinet and Scrutiny. (Agreed by Member Working Group 24,10.07).	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·

	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	IMPROVEMENT ACTION PLAN	DECISIONS OF MEMBER WORKING GROUP	PROGRESS
2	Poor Awareness of Role of Scrutiny			
	 Clarify and communicate the system for Scrutiny within Sefton Produce and publish widely a summary of the Scrutiny system. 	 Develop appropriate mechanisms to raise awareness of the system within Sefton of Scrutiny so that there is a clear understanding at both Officer and Member level. Use of briefing notes and the intranet to be explored. 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	Communications Strategy & Plan is currently being developed which will incorporate the development of web pages and dissemination of key
	 Explore other avenues for increasing understanding and awareness of the role of Scrutiny. 	 Workshops to be commissioned to enhance and raise awareness of the profile of the Scrutiny function for all Cabinet Members and Senior Management. 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	Arrangement in place for Govern-It session (Jan 08)
	 Scrutiny awareness workshops to be organised for Cabinet and Senior Managers. 	 Organise Management Networks to increase awareness of the Scrutiny Function. 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	Induction now covers Scrutiny arrangements
		 Include information on Scrutiny in Induction Packs for new starters 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	

	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	IMPROVEMENT ACTION PLAN DECISIONS OF MEMBER WORKING GROUP	PROGRESS
4	Group Leaders to consider the selection / election process for Scrutiny & Review Committees and where possible ensure continuity of membership.	Party Group Leaders have been requested to consider current arrangements for selection of Membership for Scrutiny & Review Committees in the 2007/08 Municipal Year. Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07— it was noted that continuity would help to improve the effectiveness of S&R.	Group leaders have given consideration to membership arrangements
	Role Descriptions to be developed for ordinary Scrutiny Members.	A Role Description for Scrutiny Members was approved by full Council in September 2006. Role Descriptions to be reviewed and revised as appropriate. It was agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07 that current role descriptions are adequate.	Further amendments to role descriptions will be made, dependent upon outcome of Working Group recommendations
	 An audit of the knowledge, skills and experience of Scrutiny Members to be undertaken annually on a Committee-by- Committee basis to ensure Scrutiny Committees are aware of Member strengths. 	Members be requested to assist in the preparation of an audit of the skills, knowledge and experience within each Committee. Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	Member Development Officer has been requested to provide an audit of training undertaken by Scrutiny members
	 The annual audit to be used to help identify Chairs for Working Groups and Member Champions. 	Audit details to be made available to assist in identifying key roles for Scrutiny Members. Scrutiny members to be encouraged to chair individual working groups. Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07 – although it was noted that this was occurring on a frequent basis.	Volunteers have been identified to chair recent Working Groups
	Ensure some Working Groups are chaired by ordinary Scrutiny Members.	Volunteers to be sought to Chair Working Groups Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07 – although it was noted that this was occurring on a frequent basis.	
	 Experiments to be conducted in developing a small number of individual Member Champions for Scrutiny & Review. 	 Volunteer Members to be sought to act as Member Champions for Scrutiny & Review on a trial basis. Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	

5 | Service Committee Mode

- Officers providing reports to S&R should consider the specific role and nature of S&R. Specifically the Officers should provide one side of A4 which summarises the main issues in the report and explicitly states what is expected from the Committee.
- No Officer report to go to S&R which asks the Committee to "note the report" or that the report is provided "for information".
- No general briefings or general reports to go to every Committee without considering the particular role of the Committee.
- Ensure that agenda, minutes and reports are in an appropriate format for S&R Committee including the development of pro-formas or "model" reports.
- S&R Committees to experiment with holding meetings in different venues.
- A pre-meeting briefing to determine the strategy for the meeting (including a questioning strategy) to be held prior to every Committee meeting.
- The Authority to consider changing the title of S&R Committee to Panel to re-emphasise the change from the Committee culture.
- Layout of tables for S&R to be given greater consideration and varied according to the purpose of the meeting.
- Nameplates to be provided and a separate but distinct public seating area with spare copies of the agendas and papers.

- Officers writing reports to be mindful of the Scrutiny function and role. Guidance to be produced on the production of Executive Summaries and clear recommendations for Committees.
- Members and Officers to be advised that Scrutiny and Review is not an old style Committee and should not be receiving information reports on a regular basis. All reports recommending 'to note' be rejected by Scrutiny Officers.
- Agendas, minutes and reports to be reviewed and drafted in an appropriate house style more appropriate for Scrutiny & Review Committees.
- Consideration to be given to holding some meetings outside of Bootle or Southport Town Halls. Other venues to be explored.
- Members to consider whether a pre-meeting briefing would be beneficial, particularly prior to meetings where witnesses are giving evidence.
- Council be requested to approve the change of title from Scrutiny & Review Committee to Panel as the new look S & R's are launched.
- Guidance to be available on appropriate layout of meeting rooms for S&R Committees in order to reflect the varying roles of the Committee.
- Arrangements to be put in hand to ensure nameplates are available and appropriate areas are made available for the public

Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07 – it was also agreed that S&R Chairs would approve reports before circulation of agendas.

Not agreed by Member Working Group 015.12.07, although it was agreed that reports should change the terminology used and officers should replace the term 'to note' with 'to refer'. Scrutiny Officers to liaise with Chairs re: information items.

Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.

Agreed in principle by Member Working Group 05.12.07, subject to individual circumstances and requirements.

Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.

Not agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07, however it was recommended that Sefton adopt the national terminology of 'Overview & Scrutiny'.

Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.

Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.

ADDITIONAL: It was recommended by the Member Working Group 05.12.07 that the council explore the introduction of P.A / microphone systems to enable members of the public to clearly hear the debate.

Communications Strategy & Plan is currently being developed which will incorporate the development and dissemination of guidance

List of alternative venues has been compiled

Nameplates have been ordered and received and will be introduced at Committees

Re-visit of the handbook has begun, but amendments will be subject to any outcomes of the Working Group

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	IMPROVEMENT ACTION PLAN	DECISIONS OF MEMBER WORKING GROUP	PROGRESS
 A Head of Scrutiny to be appointed at a more senior level. Return to the three full-time equivalent level of support at least for Scrutiny unit (excluding Committee Clerking support). Scrutiny unit to be physically separated from the Committee & Member Services and not to be line managed within the Service. Committee Clerking role and functions to be provided by Committee Clerks from within Committee & Member Services and not Scrutiny Support Officers. Consideration to be given to the appropriate location of the Scrutiny unit within the officer structure. Nature of officer support from unit to change and move to research and general policy support. The skills mix and experience of Scrutiny Officers to be addressed (possibly through training and development). 	 Create new post of Head of Scrutiny and commence recruitment. Revenue funding in place for 2007/08 (budget sufficient to appoint from October 2007). Review of Scrutiny Team to be undertaken with a view to identifying appropriate resources to support the Scrutiny function. Plans have been made to relocate the Scrutiny Unit within Southport Town Hall. Review of Line Management of the Service to be undertaken. The resources made available by Council do not permit the Committee Clerking role to be separated from that of Scrutiny Support. Further review in 2007/08, with a view to making bid for growth in 2008/09. Review of the Scrutiny Support Unit to consider the location of the team within the Officer structure. Officer Support to focus on research and general policy support, with the caveat that the role of Committee Clerk will need to continue to be performed given existing resources. The skills mix of Scrutiny Officers to be considered as part of the overall review of the Unit and appropriate training and development to be put in place as necessary. 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07 – noted that these actions have already been implemented and that resource issues have so far prevented the committee clerking role to be separated from that of scrutiny support.	Head of Scrutiny took up post on 10 th September Re-structure of Scrutiny Support Team has taken place The Team Action Plan will contain specific learning & development plan to improve policy research skills of all staff, as well as addressing specific learning needs highlighted in recent PRDs

anagement of Scrutiny Process			
 Committees develop realistic and achievable work programmes based on undertaking a small number of in-depth reviews (no more than two to three per Committee p.a). Other items to be kept to a minimum. Work programmes to be selected through a 	 Members and Officers to be disciplined in developing realistic and achievable work programmes based on no more than two or three each Municipal Year. Criteria for selection currently set out in the S & R Handbook to be used as the basis for 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	Workshop sessions for development of work programmes currently being arranged for March 2008
Reason for including an item in a work programme to be set out clearly. Work programmes to be established at the beginning of each Municipal Year. Only	 Members to clearly state the reasons for including an item within the work programme. No additional matters to be included during the Municipal Year, other than on an exceptional 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	Re-visit of the handbook has begun, but amendments will be subject to any outcomes of the Working Group
urgent and unforeseen items to be included in the work programme after the commencement of the Municipal Year or on early completion of work programme.	basis. • Commitment required from key officers and	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	Committees currently receive updates of working groups' activities
 Work programmes to be established in draft form through a half day workshop involving the whole Committee. Input to be received and considered from Cabinet, Area Committees, Service Managers and Key Corporate Officers. 	Members in establishing the work programme through half-day workshops. This will assist in commitment to an interest in identifying items to be reviewed.	rg. coo by manner, treating croop so. 12.01.	Scrutiny Support Team to receive specific Project Management Training (identified through recent PRDs)
Progress on work programmes to be an item on each Scrutiny & Review Committee Agenda. Chairs to debate progress.	 Progress reports to be standing item on all S & R agendas. Chairs to be requested to allow time for debate. 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	2 2
 In-depth reviews to be undertaken by "Task & Finish" Groups. Reviews to be rigorously managed and monitored. Reviews to be completed within a six month period and tightly project managed. Reviews should produce an evidence based substantive 	 Members and Officers to be rigorous in completing reviews within the six month time frame. Reports to be written in plain English with concise and clear recommendations. Scrutiny staff to undertake Project Management Training (PDR's). 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	
report with concise written recommendations.	Awareness to be raised amongst Officers		
 Officers within relevant services to be asked to provide information for the review. Requests to be made in sufficient time for Managers to plan their contribution in 	within relevant services of the importance of the Scrutiny process and to prioritise requests for information for the review. Lead in times to be sufficient to enable Managers to respond.	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	

advance.advance.

	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	IMPROVEMENT ACTION PLAN DECISIONS OF MEMBER WORKING GROUP	PROGRESS
8	Guidance to be provided to Service Managers to cover the role of Scrutiny; the type of information needed for Scrutiny; the role of Service Managers in Scrutiny meetings; the role of Service Managers in Working Group reviews; acting as a witness to Scrutiny investigations etc.	Scrutiny & Review Handbook to be widely available. Guide to the role of Scrutiny for Officers to be prepared as part of awareness-raising of Scrutiny function. Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07 – awareness raising was seen as a fundamental issue to be addressed.	Re-visit of the handbook has begun, but amendments will be subject to any outcomes of the Working Group Communications Strategy & Plan is currently being developed which will incorporate awareness raising of Scrutiny function
			•

9	Cahine	t Scrutiny Relationship				Cross Party Member
	•	Regular meetings to be held between Cabinet and Chairs of Scrutiny at least six monthly to discuss respective forward work plans.	•	Regular meetings to be timetabled between the Cabinet and Chairs of Scrutiny to discuss relevant issues.	Agreed by Member Working Group 24.10.07 (quarterly meetings) The Working Group also agreed to hold meetings of the Chairs prior to the quarterly meeting.	Working Group – Terms of Reference
	•	Individual Cabinet Members and respective Scrutiny Chairs to consider regular information exchange meetings. Cabinet Members to attend S&R meetings more regularly, both as observers and occasional participants.	•	Arrangements to be made for individual Cabinet Members and Scrutiny Chairs to exchange information.	Agreed by Member Working Group 24.10.07. It was also recommended at the Member Working Group on 05.12.07 that Cabinet Members share work plan issues, in addition to the Forward Plan, with the S&R Chairs in order to facilitate more effective pre-scrutiny.	
	•	Scrutiny Chairs to present the findings and recommendations of Working Groups to Cabinet.	•	Cabinet Members be requested to attend S&R Meetings more regularly in order to assist in the flow of information between the two Bodies.	Agreed by Member Working Group 24.10.07.	
	•	Cabinet Members to consider selecting issues for Scrutiny Committees to investigate in-depth.	•	Scrutiny Chairs to attend Cabinet to present the results and findings of relevant reviews and the recommendations (NB this only happens on an ad-hoc basis at present).	Agreed by Member Working Group 24.10.07.	
	•	A formal procedure for responses to Scrutiny reports by Cabinet be introduced setting out the length of time for a written response to be made to include an application for the decision.	•	Cabinet Members to be involved in the workshop to establish work programmes, as appropriate (addressed elsewhere in the Plan). Scrutiny & Review Handbook and Constitution	Agreed by Member Working Group 24.10.07.	
	•	explanation for the decision. Cabinet Members to be held to account by Scrutiny. In-depth reviews to call the relevant Cabinet Member for questioning.	-	be amended to establish a formal procedure for responses to reports from Cabinet from individual Scrutiny Committees.	Agreed by Member Working Group 24.10.07.	
			•	Cabinet Members to be requested to respect and appreciate the role of Scrutiny and holding the Executive to account. Awareness raising of the Scrutiny function is addressed elsewhere in the action plan.	Agreed by Member Working Group 24,10,07.	g.

	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	IMPROVEMENT ACTION PLAN	DECISIONS OF MEMBER WORKING GROUP	PROGRESS
10	The Council to urgently address the serious weaknesses exhibited by the Childrens' Services Scrutiny & Review Committee	The comments in this report are also reflected in the recent JAR Report on Children's Services. Many of the recommendations in relation to the Scrutiny function, as a whole, will address the concerns identified by Dr. Snape. Members of Children's Services Committee are asked to support a style of working which more properly reflects the focus of the Committee and the requirement to move to an effective Scrutiny function.	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	A new Chair is now in place Follow up feedback from the JAR has been positive to changes made within the Scrutiny function

	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	IMPROVEMENT ACTION PLAN	DECISIONS OF MEMBER WORKING GROUP	PROGRESS
11	Relationship to the Performance / Improvement Agenda In the short term Head of Performance to provide information to Scrutiny on performance services to assist in the appropriate selection of work programme items. In the medium term the Council needs to link Scrutiny to the Performance and Improvement Agenda through specialist training for the Performance & Corporate Services Committee; developing a small number of Member Champions; producing clear guidance on how the Scrutiny function links to the Performance and Improvement Agenda; transferring best practice on the relationship from other Authorities, eg, exception reporting and traffic light systems.	The Corporate Assessment states that the Council provides a successful challenge to Performance; but not within the Scrutiny Function. There is a need therefore to review the relationship/arrangements for scrutiny of performance including: • Awareness to be raised amongst Scrutiny Committees of how Performance has progressed within Sefton. The Scrutiny Committees need to be provided with an opportunity to consider how they can bring added value to the performance work within the Council. • With this in mind, a Working Group of Scrutiny Champions to be established to consider a mechanism for identifying the exact specification of information for the Scrutiny Committees, in bringing added value and to further enhance and develop the performance function within Sefton. • ACE (Performance) to continue to take performance data to Scrutiny, including the 2006/07 Outturn of Performance in accordance with the new criteria developed by the Working Group. • Performance Management training to be included in the tailored Scrutiny Members Personal Development Plans.	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07. Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07. Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	Performance information is circulated to Committees Current discussion between ACE Performance and Head of Scrutiny on further development

	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	IMPROVEMENT ACTION PLAN	DECISIONS OF MEMBER WORKING GROUP	PROGRESS
12	Working within Financial Constraints and Financial Scrutiny All Scrutiny reports to state the financial implications of their recommendations and wherever possible different options to be provided in terms of financial implications, eg. increase, neutral cost or savings. Financial issues to be fully considered when selecting issues for Scrutiny work programmes, eg. poor performing services or high spending services. Some Scrutiny work to be focused on VFM studies and identifying savings.	 Members to ensure that Scrutiny reports set out clearly the financial implications of any recommendations. Links to be made to the Finance Department to assist in this process as necessary. Members to have an awareness of financial considerations when selecting topics for Scrutiny Work Programmes so that targeted reviews can be undertaken. Scrutiny Members to liaise with Director of Finance on appropriate topics for VFM studies and identification of efficiencies and savings. Closer liaison to be established with Director 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07. Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07. Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	Re-visit of the handbook has begun, but amendments will be subject to any outcomes of the Working Group – the handbook will contain guidance on financial issues Finance Dept to be invited to attend work programme sessions in March 2008
	 Finance Director to provide information on spending of services to aid the selection of issues for Scrutiny work programmes. 	of Finance to enable information on service spending to be available at the workshop to select items for Scrutiny programmes (referred to earlier in the Action Plan).	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	
the second control of the second seco		During the 2006/07 budget process, Officers were asked to broaden the involvement of Members in the MTFP and it was agreed that all four S&R's would receive briefings. During the consultation on the 2007/08 budget, the Finance Director was thanked for the additional support provided to Members and asked to develop the information further. Scrutiny Chairs are asked to consider the approach suggested by Dr Snape and whether S&R wishes to adopt the following or a more all embracing approach:		
		 Finance reports to be targeted to the appropriate S & R Committee. 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	
		 Finance Director to assist in providing additional information and training for volunteers/champions from Scrutiny Members of Performance & Corporate Services to enable them to lead on financial scrutiny work. 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	

	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	IMPROVEMENT ACTION PLAN	DECISIONS OF MEMBER WORKING GROUP	PROGRESS
13	S&R to develop specific measures to publicise its work more widely amongst partners and the public to ensure they contribute and participate more fully in S&R processes. Initiatives could include development of Scrutiny web-pages; production of information leaflets; inclusion of S&R column in Council newspaper / staff newsletter, production of S&R newsletter, S&R roadshows at supermarkets and shopping centres; co-operation of partners; users and community representatives on Task & Finish Groups; stakeholders analysis to determine who could provide oral or written evidence; expansion of use of expert witness from Universities, other Authorities, Consultancies etc. Scrutiny Support Officers to develop P&R and communication strategy for S&R. Health S&R Committee to include the opinions of service users more fully in their activities.	 New Head of Scrutiny to consider how best to raise the profile of Scrutiny more widely amongst the Council's partners and the public. To consider the various initiatives already progressed by a number of Authorities including the development of Scrutiny Web Pages, information leaflets. etc. Assistant Chief Executive (Communication) be requested to develop a P&R and Communication Strategy for S&R for approval by the Scrutiny & Review Chairs to assist in raising the profile of the function. Health S&R Committee to consider best practice from other Authorities on how to include the opinions of Service Users more effectively. 	A Communications Strategy & Plan is currently being drafted by the Head of Scrutiny who will liaise with the Corporate Communications Team - Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07. Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07 – it was noted that Health S&R do have mechanisms in place to facilitate service users' involvement.	Communications Strategy & Plan is currently being developed which will incorporate awareness raising of Scrutiny function Ideas for simple 'branding' designs have been developed As part of the learning & development plan for the Scrutiny Team all officers will be identifying best practice and making contact with other authorities through established networks and specific visits where appropriate

	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	IMPROVEMENT ACTION PLAN	DECISIONS OF MEMBER WORKING GROUP	PROGRESS
14	S&R Support Officers to develop a robust system for measuring outputs and outcomes of Scrutiny based upon good practice within other Authorities. S&R Committees to work to ensure recommendations from its reports or meetings are SMART. Information on impact and performance to be included in a re-vamped annual report for S&R.	 Head of Scrutiny to identify best practice within other Authorities and develop a more robust system for measuring outputs and outcomes of Scrutiny. S&R Committees to be mindful of the need to ensure recommendations within reports or from meetings are not too generalised but are specific, measurable, accurate, realistic and timely Format for annual report to be reviewed by new Head of Scrutiny. 	Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07. Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07. Agreed by Member Working Group 05.12.07.	Cross Party Member Working Group - Terms of Reference Research outcomes to be presented to the Working Group by the Head of Scrutiny regarding performance measurement New format annual report was recently produced but the Communications Strategy & Plan is currently being developed which will revisit the format

	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	IMPROVEMENT ACTION PLAN	DECISIONS OF MEMBER WORKING GROUP	PROGRESS
15	Scrutiny Management Board to be created. Grutiny Management Board to be created.	 A Scrutiny Management Board to be established, comprising the Chairs of all Committees. The intention would be for the Board to meet regularly with Cabinet to ensure an effective Scrutiny/Cabinet relationship. It would also have a role in ensuring there were no gaps or duplications across the work of the four Committees and to ensure that each Committee had a realistic and appropriate work programme. The Board would monitor the implementation of work programmes, share learning and good practice across the four Committees, coordinate the production of the Annual Report and ensure that reviews and recommendations are widely disseminated. Need to consider how this will be resourced and the role of and impact on Officers supporting the Board. 	on a trial basis initially.	Cross Party Member Working Group – Terms of Reference

ADDITIONAL:

The Member Working Group held on 05.12.07 held a specific discussion regarding the perception of Scrutiny & Review chairmanship in comparison to other roles. It was noted that S&R Chairs received the lowest members allowance. It was recommended that in order to acknowledge the importance of the role of Scrutiny & Review that the independent remuneration panel be requested to examine the Members Allowances for S&R chairmanships.